
Lawrence Greksa

Follow this and additional works at: https://ideaexchange.uakron.edu/amishstudies

Part of the Social Work Commons

Please take a moment to share how this work helps you through this survey. Your feedback will be important as we plan further development of our repository.

**Recommended Citation**


This Book Reviews is brought to you for free and open access by IdeaExchange@UAkron, the institutional repository of The University of Akron in Akron, Ohio, USA. It has been accepted for inclusion in Journal of Amish and Plain Anabaptist Studies by an authorized administrator of IdeaExchange@UAkron. For more information, please contact mjon@uakron.edu, uapress@uakron.edu.

By Lawrence P. Greksa, *Anthropology, Case Western Reserve University*

Anyone interested in Amish health, particularly mental health, is familiar with the publications of James Cates, a clinical psychologist who has extensive experience working with the Amish in the Elkhart-LaGrange settlement. In this book, Cates set himself the goal of providing guidance for human services professionals working with the Amish. I’m not a human services provider but, in my opinion, he succeeded in this goal. This book will also be useful for others, however, because Cates discusses some sensitive topics (e.g., drug abuse and addiction, violence towards women, and child abuse) that generally receive little attention in descriptions of Amish society.

The book is divided into four parts, with the first two parts providing background with some advice to practitioners interspersed throughout and with the last two parts providing specific advice to practitioners working with the Amish. Part one, “Culture and Context,” contains one chapter which briefly summarizes Amish society and key beliefs. Part two, “Life Experience,” contains six chapters. The first two of these chapters provide some general background relevant to human services providers, primarily mental health professionals. Cates first describes the changing relationship of the Amish with mental health professionals, particularly the increasing involvement of the Amish in mental health care. He emphasizes the difficulties of working in a “high context” culture in which there is a basic distrust of outsider service providers and provides some reasonable guidance for human service providers on what is required to overcome these difficulties.

The third chapter in part two briefly describes the Amish life cycle, from childhood to old age, including *Rumspringa.* Chapter four discusses the roles of women in a strongly patriarchal society in which their submission to men is biblically mandated. Cates argues that, although there is clearly a concentration of power in the hands of men, it is more complicated than that. He argues that women play an important role in the community and notes that men are also placed in a hierarchical system based on age and religious leadership. Younger men should be submissive to older men; ministers and bishops should be submissive to older religious leaders. In chapter five, Cates discusses sexuality. The Amish have adapted in many ways to modern life but sexuality is not one of them. This is a forbidden topic, and thus little is known, making Cates’s contribution particularly important even if limited to his experiences with his Amish clients. He argues that, as with most other behaviors, everything found in English society is also found in Amish society. An important difference is that everything outside of heterosexual sex within a marriage is equally sinful and shameful to the Amish. All require confession and repentance, and once these are accepted by the Gmay, the “slate is clean.” This makes it difficult to deal with deviant behaviors that we know are likely to be repeated. The same individual can continue with child sexual abuse, for example, confessing and repenting each time until it comes
to the attention of civil authorities. On a different topic, I didn’t find the use of condoms by adolescents surprising, but I did find it surprising that Cates sees the beginning of the use of morning after pills by some young women.

Chapter five covers violence and abuse within families. Once again, Cates argues that the same violent acts seen in English society are present in Amish society. Cates isn’t speaking of culturally acceptable—at least within Amish society—physical force in the form of spanking; he means domestic violence directed towards women and children. Spousal abuse is particularly difficult for the Amish to handle internally given the submissiveness expected of women. Child abuse is equally difficult since it can lead to the involvement of civil authorities who might decide that children need to be removed from the home. The final chapter in this section reviews Amish beliefs and practices surrounding death.

Part three, “Professional Interaction,” consists of five chapters which are the crux of the book for providers working as counselors and therapists, in the field of substance abuse and addiction, law enforcement, health care, and social work. Although some advice to practitioners was provided in the preceding chapters, these chapters include specific practices that Cates has found to be effective when working with the Amish. Cates utilizes vignettes based on his experiences to illustrate points throughout the text, but they are particularly effective in these chapters.

In the chapter devoted to counselors, Cates describes theoretical paradigms that he has found to be effective in working with the Amish (e.g. Person-Centered Therapy and Feminist Therapy). He emphasizes the importance of working with Amish clients on their own turf or in home based sessions. The two chapters on substance abuse and addictions and law enforcement are particularly relevant for youth during Rumspringa. For practitioners involved in substance abuse and addiction, Cates argues that because it is rooted in Christianity, Alcoholics Anonymous, particularly if modified somewhat for Amish beliefs, can be effective. The Amish Youth Vision project, with its participation by Amish adults, has also been effective in combating alcohol and drug abuse in the Elkhart-LaGrange settlement. The interactions of the Amish with law enforcement are particularly complicated. The Amish of course recognize the role of civil authority but at the same time believe in a separation between church and state. However, they are not necessarily well informed about the law, leading to civil authorities sometimes becoming involved in cases which the Amish feel should be handled internally. Such cases create a quandary for the agents of the law. The law is the law, but on the other hand, a prosecution for a crime which the community believes has already been handled within the church can lead to refusals to cooperate in the future and the hiding of other crimes.

The chapter covering health care covers material that will be familiar to scholars of Amish health. Cates argues, correctly I believe, that most interactions with the health care system are routine but that misunderstandings do occur. These are sometimes because of a lack of understanding of Amish beliefs by health care providers and are sometimes caused by
miscommunication. Cates argues that most adult Amish are very fluent in day to day conversation but that doesn’t mean that they necessarily understand everything that is being said in a medical setting. Unfortunately, they, like many non-Amish, will seldom ask questions, leading providers to mistakenly believe that they have been understood.

The last chapter in this section is directed towards the social workers who are called in to intervene in Amish families when cases of spousal violence or child abuse have come to the attention of civil authorities. Since such interventions can—and often do—result in a disruption of the family through the temporary removal of children, for example, these interactions tend to be viewed as unnecessarily intrusive by the Amish, making the work of a case worker particularly difficult. In order to be successful, they must devise a compromise which respects Amish culture but is also consistent with English law. This is not an easy task. If they fail, the outcome can be similar to that described for law officials, or leading the community to make greater efforts to keep such cases from the attention of civil authorities. Cates emphasizes that a successful compromise is only possible if the case worker incorporates religious leaders into the process.

Part four of the book consists of one chapter and an epilogue in which Cates summarizes guidelines for effectively working with Amish clients. These are followed by an appendix briefly describing other plain groups and another in which he provides a nice summary of the application of DSM-5 to the Amish.

In summary, this book was a joy to read and review. I highly recommend it to both human service providers and anyone else with an interest in the Amish.


By Donald Eberle, History, Bowling Green State Univ. / Northwest State Comm. College

Duane C. S. Stoltzfus states in the Preface that the story of brothers Michael, David, and Joseph Hofer and Joseph’s brother-in-law Jacob Wipf, “contributes significantly to one of the darker chapters of this period of American history.” Nearly 100 years later this, story is surprisingly and sadly relevant. In the wake of the attacks on September 11, 2001 the United States, “swept up suspects, the innocent and true warriors alike” and “descended into the ranks of nations that systematically torture prisoners.” While the historical parallels are not exact as they never are, they are nonetheless disturbing.

The four Hutterites would suffer terribly for their religious beliefs. Michael and Joseph Hofer would give their lives as martyrs, but the most disturbing aspect of the persecution of the Hutterites, as is the case with the detainees at Guantanamo, is the complexity of the situation.